Investigation of Romanian forests in Natura 2000 sites Authors Bruna Campos, EuroNatur Catalina Radulescu, Agent Green

**Editors** Roxanne Diaz, EuroNatur Gabi Paun, Agent Green Annette Spangenberg, EuroNatur Susanne Schmitt, EuroNatur

© May 2023. Agent Green & EuroNatur. All rights reserved.

Reference: Agent Green and EuroNatur (2023): Investigation of Romanian forests in Natura 2000 sites.

Cover photo: Susanne Schmidt





## **Contents of Report**

Glossary of acronyms	1
Summary	1
Introduction	2
Methodology	3
Maramures mountains Natura 2000 sites	5
Domogled Natura 2000 sites	12
Frumoasa Natura 2000 sites	18
Făgăraș mountains Natura 2000 sites	30
Bârnova Natura 2000 sites	44
Conclusions	53

## **Glossary of acronyms**

AA - Appropriate Assessment APV - logging permit EGO - Emergency Governmental Ordinance EIA - Environmental Impact Assessment EU - European Union FMP - Forest Management Plan GPS - Global Positioning System SCI - Sites of Community Importance SAC - Special Areas of Conservation

## Summary

In early 2023, investigators travelled to Romanian forested areas with active logging in five different Natura 2000 sites, four of which are subject to an infringement procedure by the European Commission: Maramures mountains, Domogled, Frumoasa, and Făgăraș mountains. Bârnova Natura 2000 was also visited to gather new information on the extent of logging in this area. In particular, the European Commission has identified that these areas have logging permits but lack management plans and impact assessments.

The report looked at 47 logging permits in 2022 and 2023 in 16 locations within the aforementioned Natura 2000 sites, seven of which were state-owned forests and nine locations were private forests. All locations had ongoing activity, such as active logging permits or wood transports. The average age of the forests visited was 125. The 47 logging permits account for 0.01% of all the logging permits in the Romanian public database of logging permits. In just 0.01% of logging permits, around 65355.89 m<sup>3</sup> of trees have been authorised for removal in 2022 and 2023, equivalent to removing 420 football fields of forested area, without accounting for the illegal logging that is also taking place.

Overall, there is a lack of transparency regarding the ongoing forest activities that should be publicly available. In particular, all the Forest Management Plans (FMPs) that were available were heavily censored; in most cases, as much as 75% - 80% of the information was removed, including vital information such as detailed parcel description, proposed logging works, previous interventions, and detailed forest maps.

Also, the FMPs occurring on private land (9 out of 16) were difficult to find publicly as this information was missing from the government's forestry database (Sumal 2.0). FMPs in private land might be added online on the Ministry of Environment's website; however, it is difficult to identify which private land the FMP belongs to because important details are missing, including owners' names and forest maps.

Environmental Impact Assessments (EIA) and Appropriate Assessments (AAs) are generally not completed for most FMPs, even though three years have passed since the start of the European Commission infringement. Out of 16 sites analysed, none had an AA, and only one had an EIA, on Valsan Valley, in Făgăraș. This specific EIA lacked in quality; for example, it completely omitted an endemic and critically endangered fish species, *Romanichthys valsanicola*, for which that specific location was protected for. As a result of ongoing active logging that has disturbed the river ecosystem, this species is now potentially extinct.

## Introduction

The Romanian government has been under scrutiny by the European Commission for not managing illegal logging in Natura 2000 sites ever since Agent Green, ClientEarth and EuroNatur submitted a complaint CHAP(2019)02656.

Under the European Union (EU), the impact of logging operations on protected species and habitats needs to be evaluated. Logging operations in Natura 2000 sites need to undergo, in particular, an Appropriate Assessment (AA). This means that in Romania, Forest Management Plans (FMPs) should undergo an AA. However, legislation in Romania lacked the necessity to undertake these assessments.

On December 16 2022, Romania passed an Emergency Governmental Ordinance 177/2022 ("EGO 177/2022"). Unfortunately, this new regulation does not interfere with the logging permits that have already been granted. The new EGO 177/2022 sets, latest, September 2023 (i.e. 9 months)<sup>1</sup> as the deadline to start the process of defining appropriate assessments ("AA") of FMPs. It is expected that once AAs are finalised, FMPs will need to be re-drafted and adapted to reflect the recommendations set out in the AAs. Consequently, it is also expected that logging permits will be retracted where needed. However, logging continues regardless of whether these legal requirements have been met.

In February 2022, EuroNatur, Client Earth, and Agent Green released <u>the first analysis on the state of</u> <u>the Natura 2000 sites</u> that are subject to the European Commission's infringement, based on field monitoring conducted in 2021. The following report attempts to provide an analysis of the state of the Natura 2000 sites based on publicly available information provided by the Romanian government and field data from 2023. The sites visited in 2023 were not the same as the ones visited in 2021.



## Methodology

Prior to field investigations, various analyses took place, which included the evaluation of satellite imagery and assessments and analysis of data from Sumal 2.0 (the Romanian public database of logging permits). Focus was given to those sites which are the subject of the Romanian infringement case: Făgăraș mountains Natura 2000 site (*Munții Maramureșului*, SiteCode: ROSCI0124), Maramures mountains Natura 2000 site (*Munții Maramureșului*, SiteCode: ROSCI0124), Maramures (*Domogled - Valea Cernei*, SiteCode: ROSCI0069), Frumoasa Natura 2000 sites (*Frumoasa*, SiteCode: ROSCI0085) but also in Bârnova Natura 2000 sites (Pădurea Bârnova - Repedea, SiteCode: ROSCI0135), which were not part of the initial Infringement case. In total, the team visited four different areas and inspected 14 individual locations within these areas. Two additional locations in Domogled Natura 2000 site were only assessed from the forestry database (Sumal 2.0) as there is currently a court order that has stopped logging in most of this site and furthermore some of the locations were too far for investigators to access on the ground.



## Data analysis

Data analysis of satellite imagery and Sumal 2.0 data was carried out before visiting the sites. Investigators looked only for specific logging permits (i.e. APVs) with larger allowable removals in the specific locations. Therefore, not all APVs were recorded. They recorded the volumes authorised for extraction and the type of logging works being carried out. A forest engineer visually estimated the volumes of wood in some of the photos from Sumal and compared this estimate to the volumes declared by the transporters. Data concerning the structure and age of the forests was also recorded. FMPs<sup>3</sup> and EIAs/AAs were checked for each area and recorded if they were available publicly on the official website of the Romanian Ministry of Environment. Where available, information such as forest

<sup>2</sup> inspectorulpadurii.ro/

<sup>3</sup> http://www.mmediu.ro/categorie/amenajamente-silvice/347

<sup>4</sup> http://mmediu.ro/categorie/evaluare-impact/21

age was derived from FMPs and EIAs/AAs. Maps were reviewed of potentially old-growth forests from different studies, including Pin Matra<sup>5</sup> and PRIMOFARO<sup>6</sup>. The team specifically focused on identifying large-scale logging from progressive logging or clear-cuts in (previously) intact habitats that had been considered to be in a favourable conservation status according to Article 17 reporting by Romanian authorities under the Habitats Directive. Extra attention was given to potential large-scale logging in very old forest stands, which could be primary, old-growth forests or high biodiversity value forests.

### **On-foot investigation**

When possible, the sites were accessed on foot. Photos were taken of each forest location visited. Details of habitat degradation were captured, such as pollution, erosion from logging roads, and damage to fauna and flora, where available. GPS tracks were recorded with individual observations of each site.

#### Drone footage

Most sites accessed on foot were also recorded with a drone. The drone footage was analysed for additional evidence of habitat degradation to complement data gathered on foot. For sites which were not accessible on foot, only drone footage was considered for the investigations.

## Types of logging

This report identifies several types of logging that are included in logging permits. Romanian legislation describes different types of logging under Order No 2535/2022<sup>7</sup> and the Forest Code 46/2008<sup>8</sup>. In this report, we have looked at five types, which can be summarised as the following:

- Progressive logging (in Romania legislation, referred as 'tratamentul regenerărilor (tăierilor) progresive' and in APVs, referred as 'T. progresive') irregular, repeated, successive and uneven cuts in different time periods throughout the "exploitable areas" which leaves gaps in the forest stand to enable natural regeneration. Treatment can last up to 30 years or more.
- Clear-cutting (in Romania legislation, referred as 'tratamentele cu tăieri rase' and in APVs, referred as 'T. rase') harvesting all trees in an "exploitable area" in a single cut, usually intended to remove/replace unsuitable forests.
- Conservation logging (in Romanian legislation referred as 'lucrările speciale de conservare' and in APVs referred as 'T. conservare') creating conditions to improve the profitability of the forest, in particular removing trees deemed to be of low-quality as to enable trees with superior characteristics. Limited to 10% of the total area and based on assessments of foresters.
- Accidental logging (in Romanian legislation referred as 'Produse accidentale I & II' and in APVs referred as 'T. produse accidentale') a "sanitary" logging by removing trees that are impacted by biotitic and/or abiotic factors including dry/drying trees, trees broken by the wind or snow, as well as those that are sick, attacked by pests or impacted by pollution.
- Successive logging (in Romanian legislation referred as 'Tratamentul tăierilor succesive' and in APVs referred as 'T. succesive') similar to progressive logging but applied to species of trees with a shade temperament, such as fir and beech.
- Logging outside the national forest inventory (referred in APVs as 'T. în vegetația din afara fondului forestier național') harvesting wood from a forest located outside the official area of the national forests. The owner has to evaluate the wood being removed through logging permits and transport notices. This type of logging is exempted from rules applied to other forestry regimes.

<sup>5</sup> http://www.mmediu.ro/app/webroot/uploads/files/2015-12-22\_Virgin\_forest\_Romania\_Summary.PDF

<sup>6</sup> Schickhofer M. & Schwarz U. (2019): Inventory of Potential Primary and Old-Growth Forest Areas in Romania (PRIMOFARO). Identifying the largest intact forests in the temperate zone of the European Union.

The logging regimes mentioned above do not consider aspects/needs of the ecological functions of the forest, including the biodiversity dependent on different types of forest succession.

## Maramures Natura 2000 sites

Maramures has a total size of 106867.45 ha and is dominated by Dacian beech forests and subalpine and alpine conifer forests. In Maramures, progressive logging remains the most widespread type of commercial logging, with some locations registering severe habitat degradation as a result of large volumes of logging.

Other areas are being impacted by accidental and conservation logging, such as Repedea, where oldgrowth forests and touristic trails have been clear-cut and left without any vegetation, degrading both forest and river ecosystems and causing a complete loss of valuable hiking trails. A large percentage of the forests are private or owned by town halls, and there is a lack of information that is publicly available for these forest parcels in Sumal.

#### 47°48'40.2"N 24°29'55.9"E **GPS** coordinates Visited on March 2023 Age data ranges from 75 to 90 years old Forest age Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023 Various periods ranging from 31.01.2022 to 31.12.2022 2100144000101 - Progressive logging - 342.73 m<sup>3</sup> 2100144001310 - Progressive logging - 3687.89 m<sup>3</sup> APV - logging type - volume 2100144000160 - Progressive logging - 1400 m<sup>3</sup> 2100144003280 - Progressive logging - 2019.61 m<sup>3</sup> 2100144002410 - Progressive logging - 1819.02 m<sup>3</sup> Owner is the Romanian federal government and the Forest owner & administrator administrator is Os Poieni Yes. UP6 Poieni, from 2016, but not fully transparent on management measures. Parcel description, the forest cutting FMP available online plan and for other forestry works and records , surface movements and other important information are missing. Missing pages for example: 1-104, 153-190, 218-... EIA/AA available online No Yes Forest map available online Eroded logging roads observed Yes Polluted waterways observed Yes Steep slopes observed Yes, frequently over 30 % inclination

### Location 1: Poienile de sub munte

#### Additional notes:

This area has large volumes of wood being logged in Sumal. Between the 5 APVs detailed above over 9000 m<sup>3</sup> have been officially extracted. The APVs have expired at the end of 2022, but logging continued in 2023, as evident from numerous transports leaving this area in the last three months. It is unclear if the APVs have been extended here or if logging is illegal, as no APV extensions have been included in Sumal. Also, there are additional strong suspicions of illegal logging, as recent wood transports in Sumal appear to be severely underestimating the total volumes transported (see below three examples).

Neither the FMP nor the EIA/AA were found online. It is therefore assumed that logging in this area is done without an EIA/AA. Furthermore, Romanian law states that progressive logging should only be authorised in forests aged 100+ years in mixed forests. The current logging permits have been given for progressive logging in forests aged 75 yrs (parcel 61A) and 80 yrs (parcel 59A). However, exploiting trees of lower ages are justified if in the FMP, it is determined that the forest has low to medium wood productivity.

When the area was visited, there was active logging, with loggers and tractors moving wood, and therefore the area could not be approached<sup>9</sup> on foot. Instead, drones were used to assess the situation further. From the drone footage, it shows large-scale habitat fragmentation following successive progressive logging in the last two years. Most logging works that have been authorised are for final progressive works but drone photos show large areas of past logging that have not regenerated, leaving behind a barren landscape.

Deep logging roads are present everywhere, with signs of heavy erosion. Large volumes of lowerquality (firewood) appear to have been left behind in the forest, while the quality logs wanted by the industry have been removed.

Once logging activities are completed, further monitoring will need to be undertaken on foot to understand how the forest has been impacted as a result of these recent loggings.



9 Governmental Decision 236/2023 and the Technical Norms Order no 1540/2011, which support the implementation of the Forest Code of 2008 (Law no. 46/2008

Informații Aviz de Transport	) p Transport: Locul Recoltàrii	Provenienta: 2100144001310 - 608 BARTDAUCINU MARE
Tip Transport: Locul Recoltani Provenienta: 2100144002410 - 645 BARDAICINU MARE	Cod Aviz: AP23004846001504529603291507	Data Emiterii: 29/03/2023 15:07:55
Ced Aviz: AP23003786000066533903311529 Data Emiteric 37/03/2023 15:29:45	Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: MM45VM	Valabilitate: 29/03/2023 15/07 55 - 30/03/2023 01/07 55
Nr. Identificare Milloc Transport: MM05MLY Valabilitate: 31/03/2023 15:28:45 - 31/03/2023 21:29:45		Provide All All All All All All All All All Al
Informații Entități Implicate	Informația	i Entități Implicate 💦 🔨
12	Emitent	
Emitent Desumire: LONGA EXPLO FOREST SRL	Transportator CUI: 41684887	a SHL
Transportator Cue 35592878	Punct de Descliecare	
Punct de Descârcare		
Volum ~		Volum
Grupe Speck FAIL DIVERSE TARI	Grupe Specii	RÁSINOASE
Special FAG, PAG, PAG, PAG, PAG, PAG, PAG, PAG, P	Specia	M000
Total (mc) 8.402400	Turtal (mc)	16.745200
Poze Transport A	Poz	re Transport A
7		
3 Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării	Provenienta: 2100144001310 -	608 BARTDAUCINU MARE
Cod Aviz: AP23004846001404529603210843	Data Emiterii: 21/03/2023 08:4	3:09
N. M. M. AND	M-1-1-10	00 01/00/0000114-10-00
Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: MM45VIM	Valabilitate: 21/03/2023 08:43:	09-21/03/2023 14:43:09
3		
Informații Entită	ăti Implicate	
internet Ende	u inpuede	
Emitent		
Denumire: PETRECICA SRL		
The second		
Transportator CUI: 41684887		
Punct de Descărcare		
Volur	m	^
Grupe Specii		
Grupe Speca	FAG	
Specii	FAG	
Sortimente	Lemn rotund	
Total (mc)	14.296190	
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
Poze Tran	nsport	^

Figure 5: (1) declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 31.03.23 under APV # 2100144002410 that declared 8.40 m<sup>3</sup>, while photos are showing an estimated load between 15-20 m<sup>3</sup>. (2) Declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 29.03.23 under APV # 2100144001310 that declared 15.75 m<sup>3</sup>, while photos are showing an estimated load between 20-25 m<sup>3</sup>. (3) Declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 21.03.23 under APV # 2100144001310 that declared 14.29 m<sup>3</sup>, while photos are showing an estimated load between 25-30 m<sup>3</sup>.

### Location 2: Repedea, Maramures mountains

GPS coordinates	47°51'48.8"N 24°23'22.2"E
Visited on	March 2023
Forest age	No age data in Sumal
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 01.01.2022 to 06.04.2023. There is also one APV dating to 2021.
APV - logging type - volume	2200144002450 - conservation logging - 1876 m <sup>3</sup> 2100144001140 - conservation logging - 2109 m <sup>3</sup> 2100144003700 - conservation logging - 478 m <sup>3</sup> Pre-2022 2000144000061 - conservation logging - 1692 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	Owner Unknown, Administrator is Ocolul Silvic Poieni
FMP available online	No
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	No
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 40 % inclination

#### Additional notes:

This area has logging sites identified as primary and old-growth forests in the PRIMOFARO study, and the route to the location was an officially marked hiking route through a beautiful steep valley dominated by old-growth forests.

Unfortunately, the area resembled a war zone: where in the past there were secular forests now there are barren mountains with almost no vegetation left. This aggressive and commercial logging is considered "conservation logging" since progressive or clear-cuts are not allowed on steep slopes of over 35%. However, it is unclear for what conservation this logging is creating, given that the logging is just as bad as clear-cuts and should not be allowed on such steep slopes.

The path that used to be an official hiking trail has been widened using excavators into large logging roads to log the forest on slopes often over 40% inclination. The stream that runs alongside the roads has been polluted by heavy trucks and used as a route to pull down trees from the slopes above. Large volumes of wood have been left behind in the water.

These forests are either private or belonging to the local town halls, and the data on the age or structure of these forest parcels is missing from Sumal. Footage from the drone showed numerous logging roads crossing the landscape, with strong signs of erosion on very steep slopes and tractors pulling wood from the forest.



Figure 6: (top) photo of official hiking trail markings inside Maramures Natura 2000 site; (bottom) photo of recent logging roads and eroded soil. Both photos were taken in March 2023



*Figure 8: (top) photo of recent logging; (bottom) aerial photo of logged area. Both photos were taken in March 2023.* 



Figure 7: (top) photo of plastic tubes abandoned on the ground pollute the river and riverbed; (bottom) recently cut logs that have been abandoned on the local river. Both photos were taken in March 2023.



Figure 9: (top) photo of recent logging with logs being dragged and abandoned in the local river; (bottom) aerial photo of recent logging roads. Both photos were taken in March 2023.

### Location 3: Vaser Valley, Viseul de sus

GPS coordinates	47°44'46.1"N 24°33'20.3"E
Visited on	March 2023
Forest age	There is no age data from Sumal or in other public sources
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 29.08.2022 to 23.08.2023
APV - logging type - volume	2300173700360 - Accidental logging - 169.7 m <sup>3</sup> 2300173700480 - Accidental logging - 74.7 m <sup>3</sup> 2200173702770 - Accidental logging - 502.61 m <sup>3</sup> 2200173702780 - Accidental logging - 1719.70 m <sup>3</sup> 2200173701620 - Accidental logging - 527.42 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	Owner Unknown. Administrator is Ocolul Silvic Composesoral S.R.L.
FMP available online	No
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	No
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 30 % inclination

#### Additional notes:

Logging permits in this area were given for accidental logging, but from the drone footage little evidence was found of windfells or dead trees to justify these types of interventions. Furthermore, the drone footage also showed several sites that were impacted by habitat fragmentation following recent successive interventions that removed over 2500 m<sup>3</sup> in volume, but very little evidence to support the need to remove such large volumes of wood.

Deep logging roads are present everywhere throughout the area, with signs of heavy erosion. Logging is also taking place on steep slopes, of over 30% inclination, and heavy machinery such as excavators and diggers are being used to build new logging roads on steep slopes that are prone to erosion.



Figure 10: (top) close up aerial photo of heavy machinery excavating new logging roads; (bottom) aerial photo of new logging site. Both photos are taken in March 2023.



Figure 11: (top) photo of a local log yard and trucks in the vicinity of the logging site. (bottom) close-up photo of large logs from old forests. Both photos were taken in March 2023.



Figure 12: (left) close up aerial photo of recent logging showing that the majority of trees have been cut and not damaged by wind, as claimed by administrators; (right) aerial photo of local wood depot by the side of the river with signs of wood being dragged through water. Both photos were taken in March 2023.

## **Domogled Natura 2000 sites**

Domogled has a total size of 62118.01 ha and is dominated by Illyrian beech forest. The site was not visited on foot, since most logging is currently suspended following various court decisions based on complaints filed by Agent Green and some of the locations are remote and difficult to reach (e.g. location 5 mentioned below). However, not all forest owners are impacted by these court decisions. Therefore, in some areas, logging is still allowed to continue.

#### Location 4: Corlan, UPI, OS Brancusi

GPS coordinates	45°10'53.9"N 22°46'54.7"E
Visited on	Not visited, information taken from Sumal
Forest age	No age data from Sumal
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 01.02.2022 to 30.12.2022
APV - logging type - volume	2100165902090 - Progressive logging - 413.39 m³ 2200165901740 - Accidental logging - 47.49 m³
Forest owner & administrator	Owner unknown. Administrator is private: Ocol Os Brancusi
FMP available online	No
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	No
Eroded logging roads observed	No
Polluted waterways observed	No
Steep slopes observed	Very likely according to Google Earth

#### **Additional notes:**

The APVs expired at the end of 2022, but logging continues, as evident from numerous transports leaving this area in the last 3 months. It is unknown if the logging permits have been extended or if logging is illegal, as APV extensions are not shown. Nevertheless, the photos show fresh logs rather than logs that have been left for 3–4 months under the rain. Furthermore, illegal logging is most likely occurring in this area, as recent wood transports in Sumal appear to be severely underestimating the total volumes transported (see below three examples).

Neither the FMP nor the EIA/AA are available online. It is therefore assumed that logging is done without an EIA/AA.

		Informati	i APV		^
Număr APV: 2100	165902090	UP.1		Natura Produs	s: Principale codru
Ocol: OCOLUL SI	LVIC BRÂNCUSI	UA: 178A; 178A; 178	3A		atament: T. progresive
Denumire APV: 11		Judet: GORJ		(punere în lum	
Stare APV: Predat		Volum inițial: 413.3	9		xploatare: de la 2022-09- 22-09-30, de la 2022-02-01 04-15
	Grupă Spec	le		18	Volum
	FAG				413.39
	Total				413.39
<u></u>		Informații Sup	limentare		^
Autorizație exploatare	de	Titular: Vixnel Trans S.B.L			
			2) 		
		Numar: A220016590014			
		Emitent: Vixnel Trans S.R.	L		
	Informații Aviz de Transpo		3	informații Aviz	de Transport
anaport: Locul Recoltàri		nte: 2100165902090+116-P2-CORLAN	Tip Transport Locul Recoltàrii		Provenienta: 2100165902090 - 116-P2-CORLAN
Hz AP2300926300130558370403120		itterik: 03/04/2023 12:05:48	Cod Aviz: AP23009263001505583		Data Emiteri: 29/03/2023 12:30:08
entificare Mijloc Transport: GJ16SNO	Valabilit	ate: 03/04/2023 12:05:48 - 03/04/2023 18:05:48	Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: G		Valabilitate: 29/03/2023 12 30:08 - 29/03/2023 18:30
	İnformații Entități Implicat	e		- Informații Entit	ăți împlicate
itent	umine: World Trans S.R.L.		Emitent	Denumine: Vixnel Trans S.R.	6
	21783215		Transportator	CUE 21783215	
not de Descilincare			Punct de Descântare		
	Volum			Volu	m —
pe Specik	745		Grupe Specil	FAG	
d	845		Specil	FAS	
threate.	Leinin de fois, Leinin rotund		Sortimente	Leme de foo.	Lemin rotund
(w) (mr)	13.682320 Poze Transport		Total (md)	15 384295	
			MINI SEL	Poze Tra	nsport
			AP2 MARCH PICTURE ALL PROVIDED		
	1 11240046500			1 1 1 6 2 2 2	

Figure 13: (1) APV #2100165902090 for progressive logging with an end date of 30.09.2022; however, logging continues in April 2023 given the freshly cut logs shown in Sumal. (2) Declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 29.03.23 under APV #2100165902090, showing freshly cut logs of 15.39 m<sup>3</sup>, while the photos show an estimated load between 20-25 m<sup>3</sup>. (3) Declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 03.04.23 under APV #2100165902090, showing freshly cut logs show an estimated load between 20-25 m<sup>3</sup>.

- 27-	Informatii	APV	<u> </u>
Număr APV: 2200165901740	UP: 1		Natura Produs: Produse extraordinare
Ocol: OCOLUL SILVIC BRÂNCUȘI	UA: 178A; 178A; 178	A	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. produse
Denumire APV: 231-ISAP116-178-	Judet: GORJ		accidentale I
CORLAN	Volum inițial: 47.49		Perioade de exploatare: de la 2022-11- 22 pana la 2022-12-30
Stare APV: Predat			
Grupă Sp	ecie		Volum
FAG			47.49
Total			47.49
	Informații Sup	limentare ——	^
Autorizație de exploatare	Titular. Vixnel Trans S.R.L.		
	Numar: A220016590243		
	Emitent: Vixnel Trans S.R.	0	
2 leformații Aviz de 1	ransport	3	Informații Aviz de Transport
p Transport: Locul Recoltăni of Aviz: AP23009263001405583703311248	Provenienta: 2200165901740 - 231+ISAP116-178-CORLAN Data Emiteri: 31/03/2023 12:45:15 Kalabilitade: 31/03/2023 12:45:15 - 31/03/2023 16:45:15	Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării Cod Aviz: AP23009263001305583703 Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: GJ16	SND Valabilitate: 31/03/2023 12:41:11 - 31/03/2023 18:41:11
Informații Entități I	inglicate		Informații Entități Implicate
Emitent Denumite: Vivref Trans S.R.L. Transportator CUR 21763215 Punct de Descárcaire		Emitent Transportator Punct de Descârcare	Denumire: Vixnei Trans S.R.L. CUI: 21783215
			Volum
Grupe Special FAG		Orupe Specii	#40
Specii FAS		Specil	FAG
Soctoremente Lamo de foc. Lamo Tanal (mo) 14.768500	t rotund	Sortimente Total (mc)	Lemin rotund 13 797190
Poze Transp	at -		Poze Transport

Figure 14: (1) APV #2200165901740 for accidental logging with an end date of 30.12.2022; however, logging continues here in March 2023 judging by the freshly cut logs transported in Sumal (see figures 20 & 21). (2) declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 31.03.23 under APV #2200165901740, showing freshly cut logs and underestimated load: 14.78 m<sup>3</sup>, while the photos show a load of around 20 m<sup>3</sup>. (3) declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 31.03.23 under APV #2200165901740, showing freshly cut logs and underestimated load: 14.78 m<sup>3</sup>, while the photos show a load of around 20 m<sup>3</sup>. (3) declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 31.03.23 under APV #2200165901740, showing freshly cut logs and underestimated load: 13.79 m<sup>3</sup>, while the photos show a load of around 20 m<sup>3</sup>.

### Location 5: Gusita family-owned land

GPS coordinates	45°06'35.4"N 22°42'06.5"E
Visited on	Not visited, information taken from Sumal
Forest age	No age data from Sumal
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 17.01.2022 to 30.06.2023
APV - logging type - volume	2200636904980 - Logging outside the forest fond - 426.87 m <sup>3</sup> 2300636900260 - Logging outside the forest fond - 369.78 m <sup>3</sup> 2300188800030 - Logging outside the forest fond - 241.32 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	Owner Unknown. Administrator is Ocolul Silvic Pades
FMP available online	No
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	No
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 30% inclination

#### Additional notes:

This site has naturally reforested for the past 30 years as a result of the abandonment of the mountain pastures. These areas are being logged without any FMPs/EIAs/AAs, despite this area being inside Domogled National Park, Domogled Unesco buffer zone and two Natura 2000 sites (SCI and SPA). While Romanian authorities are spending hundreds of millions of euros of EU funds<sup>10</sup> to artificially plant relatively small areas with new forests (approximately 56,000 ha), they are also cutting down much larger areas of hundreds of thousands of hectares of naturally reforested mountain pastures in an effort to continue receiving EU agricultural subsidies for pastures<sup>11</sup>, even though most of these pastures have now been abandoned by shepherds for many years.

This location is considered to be just outside the National Forest Fond<sup>12</sup> (area that has been officially declared as a forest). Forested vegetation outside the National Forest Fond is estimated around 838000 ha. There's been an increased logging outside the National Forest Fond, even if these areas are in Natura 2000 sites. In this location, around 1000 m<sup>3</sup> have been authorised to be logged. These forests can be logged at any age and on unlimited types of surfaces.

11 Requests from the Ministry of Agriculture to the Ministry of the Environment to cut down hundreds of thousands of hectares of reforested mountain pasture: https://andreiciurcanu.ro/2022/08/08/ministerul-agriculturii-vrea-sa-puna-toporul-pe-pasunile-impadurite/

12 The National Forest Fond has been evaluated in 2018 at 7037606 ha in the National Forest Inventory: https://roifn.ro/site/rezultate-ifn-2/

<sup>10</sup> Annoucement of EU funds to plant new forests: https://www.hotnews.ro/stiri-mediu-25925813-start-pentru-56-000-hectare-noi-paduri-pana-2026-fonduri-din-pnrr-bani-pot-primi-proprietarii-terenuri.htm 15

	Informatii APV	^
Număr APV: 2200636904980	UP. 87	Natura Produs: Tăieri în vegetație din afara f.f.
Ocol: OCOLUL SILVIC PADEȘ	UA: 2870729183640; 2870729183640;	
Denumire APV: 7285 Gusita Ioana	2870729183640; 2870729183640	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. în vegetația din afara fondului forestier național
Stare APV: Predat	Județ: GORJ	
Stare APV: Predat	Volum inițial: 426.87	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2023-03- 08 pana la 2023-07-31
Grupă Specie	ė	Volum
FAG		370.55
DIVERSE TARI		5.91
DIVERSE MOI		50.41
Total		426.87
in and a second s		
	Informatii APV	
umăr APV: 2300636900260	UP.11	Natura Produs: Tăieri în vegetație dir
col: OCOLUL SILVIC PADES	UA: 5484,5485,54865489;	afara f.f.
	UA: 5484,5485,54865489; 5484,5485,54865489;	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. în vegetația
enumire APV: 7308 Gusita Dionisie	5484,5485,54865489	din afara fondului forestier național
are APV: Predat	Județ: GORJ	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2023-0
	Volum inițial: 369.78	17 pana la 2023-06-30
Grupă Specie	Contraction Condense	Volu
FAG		369.7
Total		369.7
	Informatii APV	
Număr APV: 2300188800030	UP. 8	Natura Produs: Tăieri în vegetație din
Col: OCOLUL SILVIC BAIA DE ARAMA		afara f.f.
	UA: 107VAF; 107VAF; 107VAF	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. în vegetația
Denumire APV: P 2035 Cantonul 5-T.din A.F.FGușiță Dionisie	Judet: GORJ	din afara fondului forestier național
stare APV: Predat	Volum inițial: 241.32	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2023-01-
Grupă Specie		31 pana la 2023-05-12 Volum
Grupa apecie		
FAG		
FAG DIVERSE TARI		238.82

Figure 15: three different APVs in one location for logging works outside the National Forest Fond.

1 Tip Transport: Loo	cul Recoltării	Provenienta: 2200636904980 - 7285 Gusita Ioana	
Cod Aviz: AP2300	6528000608540004011143	Data Emiterii: 01/04/2023 11:43:17	
Nr. Identificare Mi	ijloc Transport: GJ99MFA	Valabilitate: 01/04/2023 11:43:17 - 02/04/2023 23:43:17	
ų	Informați	ii Entități Implicate ————— ~	
Emitent	Denumire: Tracagricol	1. ALC 0.1	
Transportator		e Add S.H.L	
Punct de Desc	ärcare		
			1
5		Volum ^	8
Grupe Specii		FAG	
Specii		FAG	
Sortimente		Lema de foc	
Total (mc)		6.818760	
2	informatii Aviz de Transport	3 Informanții Aviz de Transport	
Tip Transport: Locul Recoltàrii Cod Aviz: AP2300652800080629720 Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: GJ8	Provenienta: 2200636904580 - 7285 Gusite Io 0311642 Data Emiteri: 91/00/2023 16.42-46	Tip Transport: Local Recoltàrii         Provenients: 2200636004980 - 7285 Guaita Ican.           Cod Aviz: AP23006528000606297203290954         Data Emiterik: 29/03/2022 09:54 18	
	Informații Entrăți Implicate	htformatji Extitibij Implicate	
Emitent Transportator Punct de Descârcare	Denumine: Tracagricole Abc S.R.L. CUI: 37540620	Emitent Denomine: Tracagricole Abo S.R.L. Transportator COII: 37540520 Punct de Descâncare	
-	Volum		
Once Taxcil	FAG, DIVERSE MOI	Strupe Specifi FX-0	
Specii Sortimente	PAG, PLOP TREMURÄTOR Lemminstund, Lemminde Foc	Spesi 743	
Total (mc)	8.190000	Earlineate Letin da foc Total (ma) 6.448000	
-	Poze Transport	Poze Transport	
Figure 16: (1)_da	pelaration of vehicle transporting w	and on 01.04.23 under APV #2200636904980 without ph	ho

Figure 16: (1) declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 01.04.23 under APV #2200636904980 without photos attached. Attaching photos is a legal requirement in Sumal, for registered companies. Without photos, it is impossible to check what was transported. (2) Declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 31.03.23 under APV 2200636904980 with a declared load of 8.19 m<sup>3</sup>. (3) Declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 29.03.23 under APV #2200636904980 showing a similar load on the photo as Figure 22, but this time with a lower declared total volume of 6.44 m<sup>3</sup>.

## Frumoasa Natura 2000 sites

Frumoasa has a total size of 137306.20 ha and is dominated by subalpine and alpine conifer forests. Locations at Frumoasa were being clear-cut and had the highest amount of extractions. Some of the locations were forested areas of 180 years old. In some cases, there were signs of previous clear-cuts dating a couple of years back but logging permits could not be found.

#### Location 6: Vidra dam

GPS coordinates	45°27'39.7"N 23°45'54.3"E
Visited on	March 2023
Forest age	Ages in Sumal range 75 – 120 years old
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Active. Various periods ranging from 01.01.2022 to 30.06.2023
APV - logging type - volume	2200156700460 - Clear-cuts - 1537.63 m <sup>3</sup> 2200156700510 - Clear-cuts - 1583.47 m <sup>3</sup> 2100156700890 - Clear-cuts - 2602.94 m <sup>3</sup> 2100156700820 - Clear-cuts - 1872.77 m <sup>3</sup> 2100156701110 - Clear-cuts - 2139.37 m <sup>3</sup> 2100156700760 - Clear-cuts - 1288.06 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	State property, administrator is Ocolul Silvic Voineasa
FMP available online	Yes, from 2014. Pages 2-3 and 63- to the end are missing.
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	Yes, but only in Sumal
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 30% inclination

#### **Additional notes:**

Over 11,000 m<sup>3</sup> will be extracted from the six logging permits for this area, all through clear-cuts. Recent wood transports in Sumal appear to be severely underestimating the total volumes transported (see below two examples). Neither the FMP nor the EIA/AA can be found online. It is therefore assumed that logging occurs without an EIA/AA.

Deep logging roads are present everywhere, with signs of heavy erosion. Logging takes place on steep slopes (over 30%) and heavy machinery is being used to build new logging roads on steep slopes that are prone to erosion.

Further on-foot investigation should take place in the logging area to determine the extent of the impact on the forest.



Figure 17: aerial photo of the area showing a heavily fragmented landscape, taken in March 2023



Figure 18: aerial photo of the area showing several clear-cuts impacting this area, taken in March 2023



Figure 19: aerial close-up photo of a recent clearcut, taken in March 2023



Figure 20: photo of heavy machinery - excavator digging a new logging road; (bottom) photo of a forest wood deposit. Both photos are taken in March 2023



ip Transport: Locul Recoltàrii	Provenienta: 2200156700750 - 724=Goata Mica
ed Aviz: AP230048523010020435040511	42 Date Dnitterik: 05/04/2023 11:42:07
r. Identificare Mijloc Transport: VL082/VP	Valabilitate: 05/04/2023 11:42:07 - 05/04/2023 21:42:07
	informații Entități Implicate
Emilant	Number SD CCSM SPL
************	I: R01484928
Punot de Deceâncara	
	Volum
Grupe Specii	alawowala
spece	MCC0
Entimente	Lambertori
Tural (Inc)	9189400
	Poze Traveport
ig Tansort Local Recthin	Foreniera: 20015676075) - 724+Costa Nica
od Aviz: AP230048920025020-3904061	145 Data Deitarik: 05/04/2023 11/45/1
Rr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: VL7411M	Valabilitata: 05/04/2023 11:4511 - 05/04/2023 21:4511
	informatii Entitäti Implicate
Emitent	
*	enumber 50 CC5M 3PL
O Punct de Desoôncaro	U: RC1484928
	Volum
Stope Specifi	alamova
lipeca .	i lacidor -
Extinumts	Lano con col
Toral (Inc)	25.005000
	Pozi Transport
NA	

Figure 22: (top) declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 31.03.23 under APV #2200156700460 showing a declared load of 19 m<sup>3</sup>; (bottom) declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 31.03.23 under APV #2200156700460 showing a declared load of 25 m<sup>3</sup>. Both of these photos show underestimated loads.

### Location 7: Balu

GPS coordinates	45°26'37.0"N 23°40'23.9"E
Visited on	18.03.2023
Forest age	Unknown, no data in Sumal
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 01.03.2022 to 10.07.2023. There is also one APV dating back to 2021.
APV - logging type - volume	2200158907030 - Clear-cuts - 692.96 m <sup>3</sup> 2200158905270 - Accidental logging - 466.49 m <sup>3</sup> 2100158905490 - Clear-cuts - 863.25 m <sup>3</sup> 2100158905870 - Clear-cuts - 684.66 m <sup>3</sup> Pre-2022: 2100158901560 - Clear-cuts - 776.40 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	Unknown. Private administrator is Ocolul Silvic Privat Buila
FMP available online	No, but document exists from 2014
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	No
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 30% inclination

#### Additional notes:

Logging site is dominated by clear-cuts. As the site is under private management data is missing from Sumal concerning forest maps, management plans, age and structure of the forest.

Neither the Forest management plan nor the EIA/AA are available online. It is therefore assumed that logging is conducted without an EIA/AA.

Deep logging roads are present throughout the area, with signs of heavy erosion. Logging takes place on steep slopes (over 30% inclination) that are prone to erosion.



<b>4</b>	Informatii APV	~
Număr APV: 2200158905270	UP. 1	Natura Produs: Produse accidentale
Ocol: OCOLUL SILVIC PRIVAT BUILA Denumire APV: P 2828 TUNARU	<b>UA:</b> 39D; 39D; 39D; 36B; 36B; 36B; 35A; 35A; 35A; 37A; 37A; 37A; 38D; 38D; 38D	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. produse accidentale I
Stare APV: Predat	Județ: VÂLCEA Volum inițial: 466.49	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2022-11- 28 pana la 2023-03-27
Grupă Specie		Volum
RĂȘINOASE		466.49
Total		466.49
1014		400.45
2	Informatii APV	400.43
2	UP: 1	Natura Produs: Principale codru
2 umăr APV: 2200158907030		Natura Produs: Principale codru Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. rase benzi
2 umăr APV: 2200158907030 col: OCOLUL SILVIC PRIVAT BUILA	UP: 1	Natura Produs: Principale codru Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. rase benzi alăturate
2 umăr APV: 2200158907030 col: OCOLUL SILVIC PRIVAT BUILA enumire APV: P 2846 BALU	UP: 1 UA: 101A; 101A	Natura Produs: Principale codru Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. rase benzi
2 umăr APV: 2200158907030 col: OCOLUL SILVIC PRIVAT BUILA enumire APV: P 2846 BALU	UP. 1 UA: 101A; 101A Județ: VÂLCEA	Natura Produs: Principale codru Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. rase benzi alăturate Perioade de exploatare: de la 2023-02-
2 umăr APV: 2200158907030 col: OCOLUL SILVIC PRIVAT BUILA enumire APV: P 2846 BALU tare APV: Predat	UP. 1 UA: 101A; 101A Județ: VÂLCEA	Natura Produs: Principale codru Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. rase benzi alăturate Perioade de exploatare: de la 2023-02- 10 pana la 2023-07-10

Figure 25: APVs for both (1) accidental logging and (2) clear-cuts. Similar damage is observed (Figure 24) despite different logging regimes.

### **Location 8: Paraul Podelor**

GPS coordinates	45°26'37.0"N 23°40'23.9"E
Visited on	18.03.2023
Forest age	Unknown, no data in Sumal
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 08.04.2022 to 13.04.2023. There are also APVs dating back to 2021.
APV - logging type - volume	2200071100360 - Successive logging - 195.70 m <sup>3</sup> 2100071101520 - Accidental logging - 610.19 m <sup>3</sup> Pre-2022: 2100071100440 - Accidental logging - 667.20 m <sup>3</sup> 2100071101340 - Accidental logging - 110.21 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	Private forest. Administrator is Ocolul Silvic Miercurea Sibiului
FMP available online	No
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	No
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 30% inclination

#### **Additional notes:**

Recent clear-cuts were observed in the area that took place more than three years ago, but show no signs of forest regrowth, despite the forest legislation asking for replanting to be done in a maximum of two years from logging. The current logging permits are for successive and accidental logging. Former logging permits are no longer available in Sumal. Therefore, information on what type of logging has been carried out in the recent past is missing.

Neither the Forest Management Plan nor the EIA/AA are available online. It is therefore assumed that logging in this area is conducted without an EIA/AA.

Deep logging roads are present everywhere, with signs of heavy erosion. Logging takes place on steep slopes (over 30% inclination) which are prone to erosion.

	Informatii APV	
lumăr APV: 2200071100360	<b>UP</b> . 5	Natura Produs: Principale codru
ICOLUL SILVIC MIERCUREA	UA: 118 B Județ: SIBIU	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. succesive, împăduriri sub masiv
enumire APV: P. 235 - Pr. Podelor	Volum inițial: 195.7	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2023-01 13 pana la 2023-04-13
Grupă Specie		Volum
RĂȘINOASE		195.70
Total		195.70
	Informatii APV	
lumăr APV: 2100071101520	UP: 5	Natura Produs: Produse accidentale
COLUL SILVIC MIERCUREA	<b>UA:</b> 123 E; 123 E; 123 E; 126 A; 126 A; 126 A; 126 E; 126 E; 126 E; 125 C; 125 C;	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. produse accidentale I
enumire APV: P. 195 - Pr. cu Arini tare APV: Reprimit	125 C; 125 A; 125 A; 125 A; 121 A; 121 A; 121 A; 119 A; 119 A; 119 A; 114 E; 114 E; 114 E	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2022-04- 08 pana la 2022-08-31
	Județ: SIBIU	
	Volum inițial: 610.19	
Grupă Specie		Volum
RĂȘINOASE		610.19
Total		610.19
	Informatii APV	~
Număr APV: 2100071100440	<b>UP.</b> 5	Natura Produs: Produse accidentale
Ocol: OCOLUL SILVIC MIERCUREA SIBIULUI	<b>UA:</b> 117 B; 120 A; 121 A; 126 A; 128 A; 116 C; 125 A	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. produse accidentale I
Denumire APV: 107 - Pr. cu Arini	Județ: SIBIU	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2021-07-
Stare APV: Reprimit	Volum inițial: 667.2	22 pana la 2021-11-18
Grupă Specie		Volum
RĂȘINOASE		667.20
Total		667.20

Figure 26: (1) active APV for successive logging; (2,3) two concluded APVs for accidental logging



*Figure 27: close-up aerial photos of recent logging. Both photos were taken in March 2023* 

Figure 28: (top) aerial close-up of recent logging; (bottom) aerial photo of the area. Both photos were taken in March 2023



### **Location 9: Paraul Balelor**

GPS coordinates	45°38'30.2"N 23°38'06.0"E
Visited on	March 2023
Forest age	Old forest, aged 180 years old in Sumal (parcels 3D and 5C)
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 03.02.2023 to 30.11.2023. There are also APVs dating back to 2020.
APV - logging type - volume	2200295001640 - Progressive logging - 1485.47 m <sup>3</sup> 2200295001570 - Progressive logging - 1091.89 m <sup>3</sup> Pre-2022 2000295000211 - Accidental logging - 626.00 m <sup>3</sup> 2100295000150 - Accidental logging - 318.00 m <sup>3</sup> 2100295000340 - Accidental logging - 194.00 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	State property. Administrator is Ocolul Silvic Blaj
FMP available online	Yes, from 2018. Pages 224-597 are missing.
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	Yes, but only in Sumal where a lot of information is missing
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 30% inclination

#### Additional notes:

This site has forest stands of 180 years old, on average, and with natural species composition dominated by beech with spruce and fir. Also, the ground cover had a 0.9 consistency for parcel 3D and 0.7 for parcel 5C. This suggests that there has not been a major intervention in these parcels recently.

These types of old forests function as a rare sanctuary for all the species dependent on old trees and dead wood, as they are surrounded by mostly young forests. But despite their immense value for biodiversity the decision was made to commercially log these forests, and it is unknown if an EIA/AA has been made as this was not available online. It is therefore assumed that logging is taking place without an EIA/AA.

The Forest Management Plan is available online on the Ministry's website but is heavily censored. Out of 600 pages, only 218 are available and there are no parcel descriptions or detailed maps. The most important data about the logging, care and regeneration plans, and the detailed description of the subplots are missing.



Număr APV: 2200295001640	UP. 3	Natura Produs: Principale codru
Ocol: OCOLUL SILVIC BLAJ	UA: 3 D; 3 D; 3 D; 3 D; 3 D; 3 D	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. progresive (însămânțare)
Denumire APV: 706 Pr. Balelor	Județ: ALBA	
Stare APV: Predat	Volum inițial: 1485.47	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2023-02- 03 pana la 2023-04-30, de la 2023-09-15 pana la 2023-11-30
Grupă Spec	ie	Volum
DIVERSE TA	RI	56.17
FAG		869.50
RĂȘINOASE		559.80
Total		1485.47
2	Informații Suplimentare	^
Autorizație de	- 25	
exploatare	Titular: SC AGRO-MONTANA SRL	
	Numar. A230029500016	
	Emitent: SC AGRO-MONTANA SRL	
Număr APV: 2200295001570	UP. 3	Natura Produs: Principale codru
Ocol: OCOLUL SILVIC BLAJ	UA: 5 C; 5 C; 5 C; 5 C	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. progresive (însămânțare)
Denumire APV: 699 Paraul Balelor	Județ: ALBA	
Stare APV: Predat	Volum inițial: 1091.89	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2023-02- 09 pana la 2023-04-30, de la 2023-09-15 pana la 2023-11-25
Grupă Specie	e	Volum
FAG		734.66
RĂȘINOASE		334.82
DIVERSE TAI	RI	22.41
Total		1091.89
	Informații Suplimentare	~
Autorizație de exploatare	Titular. SC STEFAN FOREST SRL	
	Numar. A230029500018	
	Emitent: SC STEFAN FOREST SRL	
Figure 32 <sup>,</sup> two active APV/s #220	0295001640 and #2200295001570 for	first stage progressive logging in parcels 30

Figure 32: two active APVs #2200295001640 and #2200295001570 for first stage progressive logging in parcels 3D and 5C, both aged 180 in Sumal

	Informații Aviz de Transport
lip Transport: Locul Recoltării	Provenienta: 2200295001640 - 706 Pr. Balelor
Cod Aviz: AP230063750017017550040	031602 Data Emiterii: 03/04/2023 16:02:14
Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AB140	Valabilitate: 03/04/2023 16:02:14 - 04/04/2023 02:02:14
	Informații Entități Implicate
Emitent	Denumire: SC AGRO-MONTANA SRL
Transportator	CUI: 5665552
Punct de Descărcare	
	Volum
Grupe Specii	RĂȘINOASE
Specii	MOLID
Sortimente	Lemn de foc, Lemn rotund
Total (mc)	17.061800
	Poze Transport         Image: Construction of the second
AP2200637500170175500402	1602 0 PM 0 PM 0 PM 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0

*Figure 33: declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 03.04.23 under APV #2200295001640 from parcel 3D, showing a declared load of 17.06 m<sup>3</sup>, while the photos seem to suggest an estimated volume of over 20 m<sup>3</sup>.* 

# Făgăraș Mountains Natura 2000 sites

Făgăraș mountains has a total size of 198711.49 ha and the forests observed in this report are, on average, 180 years old and should be strictly protected. Around 10000 ha to of forests in Făgăraș mountains are already included in the National Catalog of Virgin and Quasi-virgin forests of Romania, and therefore protected. However, there are still thousands of ha of primary and old-growth forests in these mountain still not protected. The decision to progressively log these forests will probably mean a complete removal of most mature trees within 20-30 years. Substantial volumes of wood are being extracted through heavily damaging progressive logging, creating a fragmented and degraded habitat.

GPS coordinates	45°22'07.1"N 24°43'33.6"E
Visited on	February 2023
Forest age	Unknown, no data in Sumal
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	From 22.12.2022 to 30.04.2023
APV - logging type - volume	2200013106710 - Conservation logging - 2177.85 m³
Forest owner & administrator	Private forest. Administrator is Ocolul Silvic Muntenia
FMP available online	Yes, from 2021
EIA/AA available online	Yes, and EIA from 2021
Forest map available online	No
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 30% inclination

#### Location 10: Valea Valsanului

#### Additional notes:

Valsan valley is the last remaining area where a *cg*itically endangered, endemic species of fish (Romanichthys valsanicola) lives, a species which was the subject of several conservation projects including projects funded by the European Commission .

In the last river survey, done in October 2022, only 58 individuals of Romanichthys valsanicola were identified in an area stretching just over 1 km .

Unfortunately, logging is allowed on the steep slopes surrounding the Valsan River. The most recent logging resulted in the degradation of the Valsan River due to tractors pulling logs through the nearby stream despite assumable negative impacts on *Romanchthys valsanicola*.

Agent Green submitted a complaint to the authorities on the 21st of February 2023. Both the Forest Guard and the Environmental Guard visited the site. They fined both the administrators and the logging company but allowed them to continue logging, provided that another logging road is used to bring down logs that does not degrade the river.

The FMP was adopted in 2021 and underwent a full EIA procedure which allowed for 'conservation logging' to take place on steep slopes in the vicinity of Valsan River. It is unclear what type of forest conservation this logging is meant to support, given that the ongoing logging is in complete disregard of critically endangered species such as the Romanichthys valsanicola.

The status of this species is now unclear, and it is assumed that this critically endangered species is most likely extinct or has been severely impacted by the forest logging that degraded Valsan River over several weeks.



Figure 34: aerial photo of logging ramp showing muddy, polluted runoff spilling into Valsan River, taken in February 2023.



Figure 35: (top) photo of muddy logging road; (bottom) photo of muddy waters entering Valsan River. Both photos were taken in February 2023

*Figure 36: healthy trees being cut through so-called conservation logging, leaving behind an area void of trees. Both photos were taken in February 2023* 



*Figure 37: photos of large-scale erosion caused by recent logging works. Both photos were taken in February 2023.* 

Figure 38: (top) photo of the heavily polluted Valsan River in Valsan Keys and (bottom) in Bradetu village. Both photos were taken in February 2023.

Denumire APV: CONS P : 1314     Judet: ARGES     Perioade de exploatare: de la 2022- pana la 2022-12-31. de la 2023-01-0 la 2023-04-30       Stare APV: Predat     Volum inițial: 2177.85     Perioade de exploatare: de la 2022- pana la 2023-04-30       Grupă Specie     Compă Specie     Compă Specie       FAG     2'       DIVERSE TARI     Compă Specie	Jude;: ARGEŞ       Perioade de exploatare: de la 2022-12-22 pana la 2022-12-31. de la 2023-01-01 pana la 2023-04-30         Volum       Volum         2174.76       3.09         2177.85       3.09         2177.85       2177.85         Informații Suplimentare       ^         Informații Suplimentare       ^         Provenienta: 220001310570       1314         Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314       Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314         125       Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         3       Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         3       Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         4       Informații Entități Implicate       ^         4       Provenienta: 220013105710 - CONS P : 1314       ^
Stare APV: Predat     Volum inițial: 2177.85     pana la 2022-12-31. de la 2023-01-0 la 2023-04-30       Grupă Specie     PAG     2       DIVERSE TARI     2       Total     2'       Autorizație de exploatare     Informații Suplimentare       Mumar. A220001310590     Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL       Numar. A220001310590     Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL       Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării     Provenienta: 220013106710 - CONS P: 1314       Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125     Data Emiterit: 07/04/2023 11:25:57       Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG     Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57       Informații Entități Implicate     Informații Entități Implicate       Emitent     Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL       Transportator     CUI: 153608       Punct de Descărcare	Volum inițial:         2177.85         pana la 2022-12-31. de la 2023-01-01 pana la 2023-04-30           Volum         2174.76           2174.76         3.09           2177.85         2177.85           Informații Suplimentare         ^           Titular:         TREI BRAZI SRL           Numar:         A220001310590           Emitent:         TREI BRAZI SRL           Provenienta:         2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314           125         Data Emiterii:           07/04/2023         11:25:57           S         Valabilitate:           07/04/2023         11:25:57 - 08/04/2023           S         Valabilitate:           enumire:         TREI BRAZI SRL
Stare APV: Predat     Volum iniţial: 2177.85     la 2023-04-30       Grupă Specie     FA9     21       DivErse TARI     21       Total     21       Autorizație de exploatare     Informații Suplimentare       Autorizație de exploatare     Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL       Numar. A220001310590     Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL       Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P: 1314       Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125     Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57       Vr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG     Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57       Informații Entități Implicate     Emitent       Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL     Cul: 153608       Punct de Descărcare     Emitent	Volum iniţiai: 2177.85         la 2023-04-30           2174.76         2174.76           3.09         2177.85
Grupå Specie       2         FA9       2         DIVERSE TARI       2         Total       2         Autorizație de exploatare       Informații Suplimentare         Autorizație de exploatare       Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL         Numar: A220001310590       Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL         Tip Transport: Locul Recoltănii       Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314         Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125       Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG       Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57         Informații Entități Implicate       Emitent         Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL       Cul: 153608         Punct de Descărcare       Ul: 153608	Volum           2174.76           3.09           2177.85
DIVERSE TARI       2'         Total       2'         Autorizație de exploatare       Informații Suplimentare         Autorizație de exploatare       Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL         Numar. A220001310590       Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL         Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării       Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314         Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125       Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG       Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57         Informații Entități Implicate       Emitent         Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL       CUI: 153608         Punct de Descărcare       UI: 153608	3.09 2177.85  Informații Suplimentare  Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL Numar: A220001310590 Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL  Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314 125 Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57 enumire: TREI BRAZI SRL
Total       21         Informații Suplimentare       Informații Suplimentare         Autorizație de exploatare       Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL         Numar: A220001310590       Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL         Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării       Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314         Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125       Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG       Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57         Informații Entități Implicate       Emitent         Emitent       Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL         Transportator       CUI: 153608         Punct de Descărcare       Informații Entități Implicate	2177.85          Informații Suplimentare       ^         Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL       ^         Numar. A220001310590
Informații Suplimentare         Autorizație de exploatare         Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL         Numar: A220001310590         Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL         Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării         Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314         Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125         Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG176VG         Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57         Informații Entități Implicate         Emitent         Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL         Transportator         CUI: 153608         Punct de Descărcare	Informații Suplimentare ^ Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL Numar: A220001310590 Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314 125 Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 3 Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57 a Informații Entități Implicate ^ enumire: TREI BRAZI SRL
Autorizație de exploatare       Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL         Numar: A220001310590       Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL         Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării       Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314         Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125       Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG       Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57         Informații Entități Implicate       Emitent         Emitent       Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL         Transportator       CUI: 153608         Punct de Descărcare       UI: 153608	Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL Numar: A220001310590 Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314 125 Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 3 Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57 a Informații Entități Implicate
Titular: TREI BRAZI SRL         Numar: A220001310590         Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL         Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării         Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125         Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG         Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57         Informații Entități Implicate         Emitent         Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL         Transportator         CUI: 153608         Punct de Descărcare	Numar: A220001310590           Emitent; TREI BRAZI SRL           Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314           125         Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57           3         Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57           4         Informații Entități Implicate           enumire: TREI BRAZI SRL
Numar. A220001310590         Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL         Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării       Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314         Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125       Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG       Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57         Informații Entități Implicate       Informații Entități Implicate         Emitent       Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL         Iransportator       CUI: 153608         Punct de Descărcare       UI: 153608	Numar: A220001310590           Emitent; TREI BRAZI SRL           Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314           125         Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57           3         Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57           4         Informații Entități Implicate           enumire: TREI BRAZI SRL
Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL         Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării       Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314         Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125       Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57         Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG       Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57         Informații Entități Implicate	Emitent: TREI BRAZI SRL         Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314           125         Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57           3         Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57
Tip Transport: Locul Recoltării Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314 Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125 Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57 Informații Entități Implicate Emitent Transportator CUI: 153608 Punct de Descărcare	Provenienta: 2200013106710 - CONS P : 1314           125         Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57           3         Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57
Cod Aviz: AP23006314001902438204071125     Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57       Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG     Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 • 08/04/2023 05:25:57       Informații Entități Implicate     Informații Entități Implicate       Emitent     Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL       Transportator     CUI: 153608       Punct de Descărcare     Informații Entități Implicate	125         Data Emiterii: 07/04/2023 11:25:57           3         Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57
Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transport: AG17GVG Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57  Informații Entități Implicate Emitent Transportator CUI: 153608 Punct de Descărcare	Valabilitate: 07/04/2023 11:25:57 - 08/04/2023 05:25:57           Informații Entități Implicate           enumire: TREI BRAZI SRL
Emitent       Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL         Transportator       CUI: 153608         Punct de Descărcare	enumire: TREI BRAZI SRL
Emitent     Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL       Transportator     CUI: 153608       Punct de Descărcare	enumire: TREI BRAZI SRL
Denumire: TREI BRAZI SRL       Transportator     CUI: 153608       Punct de Descărcare	
Transportator CUI: 153608 Punct de Descărcare	
Punct de Descărcare	UI: 153608
Volum	
Volum	
	Volum 0
Grupe Specii FAG	FAG
Specii FAG	FAG
Sortimente Lemin rotund	Lemo intund
Total (mc) 19.846580	and the second se

Figure 39: (top) logging APV #2200013106710 for conservation logging, approving the extraction of large volumes of wood (2177 m<sup>3</sup>mc); (bottom) declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 07.04.23 under APV # 2200013106710 for conservation logging showing a declared load of 19.84 m<sup>3</sup> while the photos show an estimated volume of over 25 m<sup>3</sup>.
## Location 11: Grosu bridge

GPS coordinates	45°24'09.7"N 24°48'51.0"E
Visited on	February 2023
Forest age	Forests are aged 180 to 190 years old on average
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 10.03.2022 to 31.05.2023. There is also one APV dating back to 2021.
APV - logging type - volume	2200177702250 - Conservation logging - 312.44 m <sup>3</sup> 2100177703480 - Progressive logging - 2066.98 m <sup>3</sup> Pre-2022: 2100177700210 - Progressive logging - 2143.00 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	State forest. Administrator is Ocolul Silvic Domnesti
FMP available online	Yes, from 2014. Pages 113-418 are missing
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	No
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 30% inclination

#### Additional notes:

The age of the forest in this area is between 180-190 years old, on average. These forests are on steep slopes and in the vicinity of other forests that are included in the National Catalogue of Virgin Forests of Romania.

Deep logging roads are present throughout the area, with signs of heavy erosion. Logging occurs on steep slopes (over 30% inclination) that are prone to erosion.

Although the FMP is available online, all plans and detailed records of the forest are missing, including the detailed map as well. Several of the annexes are also partially censored. EIA/AA is not available online and it is therefore assumed that logging operations taking place without an EIA/AA.



Figure 40: (top) aerial photo showing a large network of new logging roads, taken on 10.02.2023 and (bottom) Google Earth photo of the location of recent logging relative to the Virgin forests in the Romanian National Catalog (in white) and PRIMOFARO study (in green).



Figure 41: (top) photo of the primary ramp for storing logs, Figure 42: (top) aerial photo of recent logging. (bottom) near logging site; (bottom) aerial close up of large logs, typical of old forests. Both photos were taken in February Both photos were taken in February 2023. 2023.

aerial close-up of a large logging road, prone to erosion.

		Informatii APV	~ ^
Numär AD\6 2200177702	250	UP. 4	Natura Produs: Lucrări de conservare
Număr APV: 2200177702250			
Ocol: OCOLUL SILVIC DO		<b>UA:</b> 193 C; 193 C	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. conservare
Denumire APV: 1032 IZV.	BALAURUL	Judeţ: ARGEŞ	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2023-02- 02 pana la 2023-05-31
Stare APV: Predat		Volum inițial: 312.44	
	Grupă Specie		Volum
	RĂȘINOASE		109.61
	FAG		202.83
	Total		312.44
		Informații Suplimentare	~
Autorizație de exploatare		Titular: OCOLUL SILVIC DOMNEȘTI	
		Numar. A230017770011	
		Emitent: OCOLUL SILVIC DOMNEȘTI	
·		Informatii APV	<u>^</u>
Număr APV: 2100177703	480	UP: 4	Natura Produs: Principale codru
Ocol: OCOLUL SILVIC DO	MNEŞTI	UA: 190 C; 190 C	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. progresive
Denumire APV: 795 BALA	URUL /	Județ: ARGEȘ	(însămânțare)
1705512		Volum inițial: 2066.98	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2022-03- 10 pana la 2022-09-15
Stare APV: Reprimit			
	Grupă Specie		Volum
	FAG		1715.24
	RĂȘINOASE		351.74
	Total		2066.98
		Informații Suplimentare –	~
Autorizație de exploatare		Titular: DECOR COM DESIGN SRL	
		Numar: A220017770087	
		Emitent: OCOLUL SILVIC DOMNEȘTI	
			an /hattaml recent ADI/ #2100177702/00 fa

Figure 43: (top) active APV #2200177702250 for conservation logging; (bottom) recent APV #2100177703480 for progressive logging, concluded on 15.09.2022.

### Location 12: Aninoasa, Sinca Veche

GPS coordinates	45°43'09.8"N 25°10'25.2"E
Visited on	February 2023
Forest age	Unknown, no data in Sumal
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	From 04.10.2022 until 15.04.2023
APV - logging type - volume	2200154300400 - Progressive logging - 5996.38 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	Private forest. Administrator is Regia Publică Locală Ocolul Silvic Pădurile Șincii R.A.
FMP available online	No
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	No
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 30% inclination

#### Additional notes:

The site is dominated by large progressive logging (5996 m<sup>3</sup> in just one APV). This site is, however, under private management and therefore, data is missing from Sumal concerning forest maps, management plans, age and structure of the forest.

Neither the FMP nor the EIA/AA are available online. It is therefore assumed that logging occurs without an EIA/AA.

Deep logging roads are present everywhere, with signs of heavy erosion. Logging occurs on steep slopes (over 30% inclination) that are prone to erosion.



Figure 44: aerial photo of the area impacted by progressive logging, taken in February 2023.



Figure 45: photos illustrating several eroded logging roads, some still in use. Both photos were taken in February 2023.

*Figure 46: photos of various machines at work transporting wood, both in small and large trucks. Both photos were taken in February 2023.* 

Număr APV: 2200154300400	UP. 1	Natura Produs: Principale codru
Ocol: REGIA PUBLICĂ LOCALĂ OCOLUL SILVIC PĂDURILE ȘINCII R.A. Denumire APV: 2960 - Aninoasa - P R	<b>UA:</b> 208 A; 208 A <b>Judeţ:</b> BRAŞOV	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. progresive (racordare) Perioade de exploatare: de la 2022-10-
Stare APV: Predat	Volum inițial: 5996.38	04 pana la 2023-04-15
Grupă Specie		Volum
DIVERSE TARI		102.28
QVERCINEE		102.82
DIVERSE MOI		27.21
FAG		5764.07
Total		5996.38
	Informații Suplimentare –	~ ~
Autorizație de exploatare	Titular: EXPLO MOLDOVAN SRL	
	Numar. A220015430129	
1	Emitent: REGIA PUBLICĂ LOCALĂ OCOLU	JL SILVIC PĂDURILE ȘINCII R.A.

despite a lack of an FMP and EIA/AA.

# Location 13: Sercaita

GPS coordinates	45°42'35.3"N 25°08'00.5"E
Visited on	February 2023
Forest age	Unknown, no data in Sumal
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 11.03.2022 to 29.12.2023. There are also APVs dating back to 2020 and 2021.
APV - logging type - volume	2200154301890 - Progressive logging - 2826.34 m <sup>3</sup> 2200154301450 - Accidental logging - 985.71 m <sup>3</sup> 2200154300030 - Progressive logging - 2872.99 m <sup>3</sup> 2200154300330 - Accidental logging - 1079.97 m <sup>3</sup> Pre-2022: 2100154300041 - Progressive logging - 2499.00 m <sup>3</sup> 2100154300250 - Accidental logging - 1429.97 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	Private forest. Administrator is Regia Publică Locală Ocolul Silvic Pădurile Șincii R.A.
FMP available online	No
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	No
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	Yes, frequently over 30% inclination

#### Additional notes:

This area has large volumes of wood (over 10,000 m<sup>3</sup>) being extracted in a time frame of three years from progressive and accidental logging. This forest is under private management and therefore data is missing from Sumal concerning forest maps, management plans, age and structure of the forest.

Deep logging roads are present throughout the area, with signs of heavy erosion. Logging occurs on steep slopes (over 30% inclination) that are prone to erosion.

Neither the FMP nor the EIA/AA are available online. It is therefore assumed that logging occurs without an EIA/AA.



Figure 48: aerial photos of areas affected by recent Figure 49: aerial photos of areas impacted by recent progressive and accidental logging, taken in February logging, taken in February 2023. 2023.



Figure 50: aerial photo of area impact by new logging roads prone to future erosion, taken in February 2023.

*Figure 51: aerial photo of logging equipment and logs from active logging area, taken in February 2023.* 

# Bârnova Natura 2000 (not included in the complaint)

Bârnova has a total size of 12234.18 ha and dominated by Dacian oak and hornbeam forests as well as beech forests. Bârnova Natura 2000 has not been included in complaint CHAP(2019)02656. However, some of these forest stands have impressive ages of 120 – 170 years old, on average, and therefore, on-the-ground monitoring took place to compare with the sites in the complaint. These mature forests are located close to the city of Iași and important for hiking, tourism, and air quality for the city. However, these old forest stands are targeted by aggressive commercial logging that aim to rapidly remove as much wood as possible.

#### Location 14: Pietrosu

GPS coordinates	46°59'32.0"N 27°40'17.5"E
Visited on	February 2023
Forest age	120 years old, on average
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 04.01.2022 to 30.09.2023
APV - logging type - volume	2200106600720 - Progressive logging - 2557.37 m <sup>3</sup> 2100106600240 - Progressive logging - 1988.92 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	State forest. Administrator is Ocolul Silvic Dobrovăț
FMP available online	Yes, from 2018. Pages 146 - 328 missing.
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	Yes, but only in Sumal
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	No

#### **Additional notes:**

The forest stands in this area are less than 5 km away from laşi city with minimal forest management. Progressive logging occurs across the road from a small, strictly protected zone called Pietrosu Reservation (80 ha). The forest in this reservation has the same age and composition as the forest that is being logged. It is, therefore unclear why the strict protection is applied only to a small 80 ha patch and not to the whole area, given that they both show old-growth forest characteristics. Once the progressive logging is complete, this forest will be severely degraded and can no longer function as a healthy habitat for all the species dependent on mature forests.

The FMP is heavily censored. All plans and detailed records of the forest are missing, including the detailed maps. EIA/AA is not available online.



*Figure 55: (left) aerial photo of active logging area; (right) aerial close-up photo of logs from recent logging. Both photos were taken in February 2023.* 

Număr APV: 2200106600720	UP. 2	Natura Produs: Principale codru
Ocol: OCOLUL SILVIC DOBROVĂŢ	<b>UA:</b> 26 D; 26 D	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. progresive (punere în lumină)
Denumire APV: 285	Județ: IAȘI	
Stare APV: Predat	Volum inițial: 2557.37	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2023-09- 15 pana la 2023-09-30, de la 2023-01-11 pana la 2023-04-15
Grupă Specie		Volum
FAG		764.30
QVERCINEE		48.75
DIVERSE MOI		240.32
DIVERSE TARI		1504.00
Total		2557.37
	Informații Suplimentare ——	^
Autorizație de exploatare	Titular: OCOLUL SILVIC DOBROVĂŢ Numar: A230010660002 Emitent: OCOLUL SILVIC DOBROVĂŢ	
Număr APV: 2100106600240	<b>UP</b> . 2	Natura Produs: Principale codru
Ocol: OCOLUL SILVIC DOBROVĂŢ	<b>UA:</b> 26 E	Fel Taiere / Tratament: T. progresive
Denumire APV: 178	Judet: IAȘI	(însămânțare, punere în lumină)
Stare APV: Reprimit	Volum inițial: 1988.92	Perioade de exploatare: de la 2022-01- 04 pana la 2022-03-31
Grupă Specie		Volum
DIVERSE MOI		327.47
FAG		1190.64
DIVERSE TARI		470.81
Total		1988.92
	Informații Suplimentare —	^
Autorizație de exploatare	Titular: SC EURO B.A.COS SRL	
	Numar: A220010660001	
	Emitent: SC EURO B.A.COS SRL	

Figure 56: active APV #2200106600720 and APV #2100106600240, concluded on 31.03.2022, for progressive logging in forest parcels 26D and 26E.

# Location 15: Poieni

GPS coordinates	47°03'25.4"N 27°40'18.8"E and47°03'09.5"N 27°39'59.5"E
Visited on	18.02.2023
Forest age	average 120 - 130 years
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 04.01.2023 to 27.10.2023
APV - logging type - volume	2100105900590 - Progressive logging - 2167.92 m <sup>3</sup> 2200105900480 - Progressive logging - 940.34 m <sup>3</sup> 2100105900120 - Progressive logging - 1462.50 m <sup>3</sup>
Forest owner & administrator	State forest. Administrator is Ocolul Silvic Lunca Cetățuii
FMP available online	Yes, from 2018. Pages 147-416 missing
EIA/AA available online	No
Forest map available online	Yes, but only in Sumal
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	No

#### Additional notes:

The forest stands in this area are between 120-130 years old based on SUMAL with active progressing logging, intending to remove around 4500 m<sup>3</sup> in a time period of 3 months. Although an FMP is available online, all plans and detailed records of the forest are missing, including the detailed map.

Local groups in the area are actively using the forest for hiking, cycling, running, and wildlife watching, according to several conversations with local people. They have noticed that commercial logging in the area is degrading the area they are often using. Local groups are now requesting that this area become a Natural Park, which would involve some strict protection (usually around 50%).



Figure 57: (left) photo of a large stump from a logged tree that is estimated to be over 200 years old; (right) photo showing the start of progressive logging in a previously intact forest. Both photos were taken in February 2023.



Figure 58: (top) aerial photo of active logging area with Figure 59: (top) aerial photo of the second active site in the recently cut logs; (bottom) aerial photo of the logging site. area; (bottom) close-up aerial photo of the loggers' Both photos were taken in February 2023.

campsite. Both photos were taken in February 2023.



Figure 60: aerial photos of active logging sites. Both photos were taken in February 2023.



Figure 61: declaration of vehicles transporting wood for APV #2100105900120 showing photos of ancient trees being removed from logging site.

# Location 16: Tomesti

GPS coordinates	47°04'42.5"N 27°40'24.0"E
Visited on	February 2023
Forest age	110 - 120 years old
Exploitation period in 2022 and 2023	Various periods ranging from 10.01.2023 to 15.03.2023. There is also one APV that dates back to 2021.
APV - logging type - volume	2100105901380 - Progressive logging - 1817.55 m <sup>3</sup> 2200105900670 - Progressive logging - 762.55 m <sup>3</sup>
	Pre-2022: 2100105900420 - Progressive logging - 2072.00 m³
Forest owner & administrator	State forest. Administrator is Ocolul Silvic Lunca Cetățuii
FMP available online	Yes, from 2018. Pages 151-490 missing
EIA/AA available online	Unknown
Forest map available online	Only in Sumal
Eroded logging roads observed	Yes
Polluted waterways observed	Yes
Steep slopes observed	No

#### Additional notes:

The area is now a heavily fragmented landscape that has been subjected to multiple logging permits. Access to the site on foot was blocked by workers. Therefore, drone footage was used to understand the level of degradation. The area needs to be revisited again to better document the area on foot. Furthermore, analysis of photos reported in Sumal for this area shows trucks leaving logging sites with sawdust. This is controversial as large logs are potentially being chopped in the forest and not declared.

Although an FMP is available online, all plans and detailed records of the forest are missing, including the detailed map.

This area is also used by the local community for hiking, cycling, running, wildlife watching and want this area protected from logging. They have put an application forward to further protect the area, but no moratorium has been placed on logging in this area.



Figure 62: (1) aerial photo of active logging area; (2) aerial close-up of active logging area. (3) Photo of a tractor at work inside logging area; (4) aerial close-up of active logging area. Photos were taken in February 2023.

Tip Transport: Locul Reportant		Provenienta 21001	08001300 - 311 Tomeati	To Tribadett Local Recoldril		Proveniente: 21301	5901380 - 311 Tomesti	
Cod Aviz AP23001014001700	000102171830	Data Emiterii: 17/02	1/202315/3011	End Adv: 4203101014001003138300171311		Data Emiltarii: 17/03	Data Selitaria 17/03/09/914-11-95	
Nr. Identificare Mijloc Transpo	NT18FET	Valabilitane: 17/02/3	2023 18:30:11 - 18/02/2023 09:39:11	Nr. Identificane Mijloc Transport	NT14757	Valabilitatic 17/02/	003 10.41 25 18/1022008 18/11.05	
	- 102							
	entermaß En	tită\$ Implicate			infor	mati Enttăți împlicate		
Emilant				Enitent				
	Denumine SC PRICOFORE	37 3#L		a second a s	Denunive (C PR	COPOREST GR.		
Transportator	CUI: 14000411			Transportator	QUE 1-999473			
Punct de Descârdare				Punct de Descârcere				
	- Vo	lun				- Volum		
Onge Speci	0/19735	TARI, 640		Enge Speril	55900760	545 E		
Renti .	PAL775 0	E MUNTE FAS		Speci		IN A WAY OF A WAY TO BE A W		
Datimente	Same of	une -		Sectors	Lanning			
Turial Smith	17,27273	÷1		Jam Nuo	19.30910			
-	Page Tr	mesport		-		Pice Transport		
To Transport Local Recolds Cod Ader Johnston Million Theorem	727602171412	Data Switerië 1500/	601380-313 <sup>-</sup> ames 2034.445.45 2034.445.45 2034.445.45 2034.445.45 2034.445.45	To Transort: Local Feed Mile Cod Ade: 402405104400103400 Re. Martiflages Million Transport		Data Smitarik 17/07/	405180 - 311 <sup>1</sup> omes 2011 - 24 - 35 2011 - 24 - 35 2011 - 24 - 35 2011 - 24 - 35	
	Informati Ent	this busilense			Infor	nati Enttăți Implicate		
Enitent	Denumine 10 PR/COPORES			Emitent	Denumine: SC PPI			
Nenapotator		T SPL		Vivine pictures	CUR: 14999411	CONTRESS OFF		
Putott de Descârcare	Cult: 14999+11			Punct de Descârcare	COC 1+399+11			
PLOCE & DESCRIPTINE				Purction Destances				
	Vol.	-				- Volum		
	100	en,						
Reas Sheri	CORPORE SWEET AND SURRERS			Enter Sparti	0.98	INF UNIT OVER 1410		
Spall	CONVICT TE ARGMITUL CARRIER P			Speil	10.1	Admitta, schedus		
Sectores	Testing Reported doctory			Sectorem	7448	and providential disclosements		
TAME (INC)	29 10 1910			TRANS (PRO)	10.00	124		
	Pope In	maport				Pose Transport		

Figure 63: (top two photos) declaration of vehicle transporting wood on 17.02.23 under APV # 2100105901380 for progressive logging, showing large ancient trees being removed from logging site.; (bottom two photos) photo of trucks full of sawdust, showing evidence that a mobile chopper is being used in the forest.

# Conclusions

The following table summarises the volume that has been allowed to be extracted in 2022 and 2023 in the 16 different locations that have been visited:

Location name	Timeframe of logging	Type of logging	Volume allowed to be extracted
Poienile de sub munte, Maramures	12 months	Progressive	9269.25 m³
Repedea, Maramures	16 months	Conservation	4463.00 m³
Vaser Valley, Maramures	18 months	Accidental	2994.13 m³
Corlan, Domogled	10 months	Progressive & accidental	460.88 m³
Gusita, Domogled	5 months	Logging outside the forest fond	1037.97 m³
Vidra dam, Frumoasa	18 months	Clear cut	11024.24 m³
Balu, Frumoasa	8 months	Clear cut & accidental	2707.36 m³
Paraul Podelor, Frumoasa	3 months	Successive	805.89 m³
Paraul Balelor, Frumoasa	9 months	Progressive	2577.36 m³
Valea Valsanului, Făgăraș	4 months	Conservation	2177.85 m³
Grosu bridge, Făgăraș	4 months	Conservation	2379.42 m³
Aninoasa, Făgăraș	5 months	Progressive	5996.38 m³
Sercaita, Făgăraș	12 months	Progressive	7765.01 m³

Pietrosu, Bârnova	6 months	Progressive	4546.29 m³
Poieni, Bârnova	10 months	Progressive	4570.76 m³
Tomesti, Bârnova	2 months	Progressive	2580.1 m³

The most widely spread logging type in the locations analysed is progressive logging, making up around 58% of the total logging allowed to be extracted. Field investigators have observed that progressive logging has been extremely damaging to the Natura 2000 sites. Investigated areas would sometimes resemble clear-cuts due to several years of progressive logging. The barren landscape in the aerial photographs of Poienile de sub munte forest (figures 1 - 4) is one example. Foresters should, in theory, respect the physiological rhythm of the forest and the dynamics of the natural regeneration process when applying progressive logging. Unfortunately, most progressive loggings occur at faster intervals, causing the forest to lose its regenerative capacity. In practice, progressive logging usually results in barren landscapes similar to areas that have been clear-cut within 15-20 years, or sooner.

Other types of logging are also problematic. For example, successive logging is similar to progressive logging and shares the similar faulty treatment application. Conservation logging is based on the subjective assessment of foresters that usually propose areas that are not intended for wood production. In accidental logging, there have been previous cases of healthy trees being removed or enabling trees to dry out so that the trees can be considered accidental products.

This report looked at 47 APVs in 2022 and 2023 in 16 locations. The Romanian database of logging permits (Sumal) currently shows 426339 APVs as of 30th of May 2023. Of these 47 APVs that were analysed, the total amount that was allowed to be extracted was 65355.89 m<sup>3</sup> within a 24-month period<sup>15</sup>, which is equivalent to around 299.79 ha<sup>16</sup> of forests. This translates to a land size of around 420 football fields. This only looks at what was allowed to be removed in logging permits and does not consider what was illegally removed. The observations of transport vehicle declarations showed that foresters tend to underreport their total load, around 20 to 50% less, highlighting that illegal logging is still occurring. Furthermore, the transport of wood from the forest is allowed for another 120 days after the end of an APV, most likely further enabling illegal logging. Also, the 299.79 ha does not take into account the degradation that is also caused by logging roads and erosion. Therefore, hundreds more forested hectares were most likely removed from just analysing 0.01% of the total APVs displayed in Sumal.

It is also important to mention that, according to their Standard Data Forms, all five Natura 2000 sites are Sites of Community Interest (SCIs), declared in 2007 and confirmed in 2009; these sites have yet to be designated as Special Areas of Conservation (SACs). Under the Habitats Directive, an SCI must be designated as an SAC within six years. To designate an SAC, a site must, amongst many aspects, have a management plan. Nevertheless, commercial logging is still allowed in these Natura 2000 sites.

The latest data analysis and field investigation also illustrate a lack of transparency in forest management. Of the 16 analysed locations, more than 50% of FMPs were not publicly available online. Of the FMPs available, almost 75%-80% had been censored and therefore, not useful to monitor the management being applied in the area. Since the end of 2020, Romanian authorities have been requesting EIAs/AAs for FMPs, and almost all FMPs adopted after 2022 have an EIA/AA. Most of the FMPs detailed in this report are before 2020, hence the lack of EIAs/AAs.

The recent Emergency regulation, EGO 177/2022, will, unfortunately, not tackle this problem of nontransparency. Without environmental information being made publicly available, citizens cannot monitor or challenge decisions made concerning forest management. This also includes civic control over whether permits have been granted in line with the recommendations of impact assessments when these are carried out. Consequently, citizens are being prevented from referring to the court even in cases where there is a serious risk of deterioration of habitats and species protected under the Habitats Directive.

Regarding impact assessments, none of the locations had AAs for their FMPs, even though AAs are required for FMPs in Natura 2000 sites. Only one location had an EIA for its FMP, but the quality of the EIA itself was poor and did not include any aspects of the species for which the site is protected. The methodology that defines the process of conducting AAs for forest activities has been recently approved through a Governmental Decision<sup>17</sup>. However, such governmental decisions can be suspended or nullified in court per Law 554/2004.

In November 2021, the Romanian government tried to pass the Governmental Decision to define a methodology for implementing AAs but failed when the court challenged the decision. Private forest owners will not carry out AAs in their FMPs without this methodology. Although implementing AAs in state-owned forests should be more feasible if there is political will and commitment from the government to deliver AAs without any legally binding legislation, incontestable legislation should still be passed to ensure AAs are applied to private forests. Furthermore, the new EGO 177/2022 sets the deadline to start defining AAs of FMPs by, latest, September 2023. There is currently no deadline to complete them; therefore, it is uncertain when AAs will be completed.

It is also expected that after AAs are finalised, FMPs will be re-drafted and adapted to reflect the recommendations in the AAs. Consequently, logging permits are also expected to be retracted where needed. However, this is assumed and not given that this will be done. Meanwhile, logging continues regardless of whether AAs have been done for FMPs. Therefore, while logging continues unabated, no assessment is being carried out to determine the level of impact any of the logging regimes might have on the conservation objectives of these protected areas.

Even if AAs are conducted for all FMPs, and these plans are properly consulted and monitored by civil society, it does not change the fact that Governmental Decision 236/2023<sup>18</sup>, the Technical Norms Order no 1540/2011, and the Technical Norms Order no 2535/2022, which support the implementation of the Forest Code of 2008, still do not consider the impact of logging types on the ecological function of the forests. In particular, progressive logging is considered to align with the conservation objectives of the Natura 2000 sites. With the current national laws, old-growth and primary forests in Natura 2000 sites will continue to be subject to complete logging, including through progressive logging, probably within 20 to 30 years. Furthermore, the Forest Code does not make it a criminal offence to log outside the national inventory of forests, even if this logging takes place in a Natura 2000 forested area, and

instead, fines are applied. These fines are not sufficient to deter illegal logging. Also, the volume of wood legally allowed to be removed outside the forest inventory is no longer subjected to a cap of 5 or 10 m<sup>3</sup> and can be thousands of m<sup>3</sup> as observed in the Domogled Natura 2000 site.

In summation, Romanian forest laws are not aligned to meet the conservation objectives of Natura 2000 sites as EU environmental law requires. Romanian laws still allow for the gradual or complete removal of entire forest cover and disregard the potential deterioration of certain protected habitats. Therefore, a moratorium is recommended in all protected forests until AAs are conducted for all FMPs and logging permits are re-assessed. Furthermore, national laws should be changed regarding logging regimes to ensure that these align with the conservation objectives of protected areas. Particular attention should be given to progressive logging. Lastly, the national inventory of forests should be updated to include all forests in Natura 2000 sites.

# **ANNEX**

Location name	Owner	Administrator	Active logging	FMP online	EIA/AA online
Poienile de sub munte, Maramures	Romanian state. OS POIENILE DE SUB MUNTE	Romanian state. OS POIENILE DE SUB MUNTE	Logging permits ended in Dec 2022, but wood transport continues as of April 2023	Yes, censored, from 2016	No
Repedea, Maramures	Private owner	Romanian State: OS POIENI	Yes, until 06.04.2023	No	No
Vaser Valley, Maramures	Private owner	Private administrator: Os Composesoral S.R.L.	Yes, until 06.04.2023	No	No
Corlan, Domogled	Private owner	Private administrator: Os Brancusi.	No. logging permits ended in Dec 2022, but transport of wood continues as of April 2023	No	No
Gusita, Domogled	Private owner	Romanian State: Os Pades	Yes, until 06.04.2023	No	No
Vidra dam, Frumoasa	Romanian State: Os Voineasa	Romanian State: Os Voineasa	Yes, until 30.06.2023	Yes, censored, from 2014	No

Location name	Owner	Administrator	Active logging	FMP online	EIA/AA online
Balu, Frumoasa	Private owner	Private administrator: Os Privat Buila	Yes, until 10.07.2023	No	No
Paraul Podelor, Frumoasa	Private owner	Private administrator : Os Miercurea Sibiului	Yes, until 13.04.2023	No	No
Paraul Balelor, Frumoasa	Romanian State: Os Blaj	Romanian State: Os Blaj	Yes, until 30.11.2023	Yes, censored, from 2018	No
Valea Valsanului, Făgăraș	Private owner	Private administrator: Os Muntenia.	Yes, until 30.04.2023	Yes, censored, from 2021	Yes, from 2021
Grosu bridge, Făgăraș	Romanian State. OS Domnesti	Romanian State. OS Domnesti	Yes, until 31.05.2023	Yes, censored, from 2014	No
Aninoasa, Făgăraș	Private owner	Private administrator : Regia Publică Locală Ocolul Silvic Pădurile Șincii R.A.	Yes, until 15.04.2023	No	No
Sercaita, Făgăraș	Private owner	Private administrator : Regia Publică Locală Ocolul Silvic Pădurile Șincii R.A.	Yes, until 29.12.2023	No	No
Pietrosu, Bârnova	Romanian State: Os Dobrovăț	Romanian State: Os Dobrovăț	Yes, until 30.09.2023	Yes, censored, from 2018	No

Location name	Owner	Administrator	Active logging	FMP online	EIA/AA online
Poieni, Bârnova	Romanian State: Os Lunca Cetățuii	Romanian State: Os Lunca Cetățuii	Yes, until 27.10.2023	Yes, censored, from 2018	No
Tomesti, Bârnova	Romanian State: Os Lunca Cetățuii	Romanian State: Os Lunca Cetățuii	Yes, until 15.03.2023	Yes, censored, from 2018	No